

Designing and Conducting **Mixed Methods Research**

*This book is for my talented, supportive children—
J. David Creswell and Johanna Creswell.*

—John

*This book is dedicated to Mark for all of his support,
encouragement, friendship, and love. I thank him to the moon and back.*

—Vicki

John W. Creswell
Vicki L. Plano Clark
University of Nebraska-Lincoln

Copyright © 2007 by Sage Publications, Inc.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information:



Sage Publications, Inc.
2455 Teller Road
Thousand Oaks, California 91320
E-mail: order@sagepub.com

Sage Publications Ltd.
1 Oliver's Yard
55 City Road
London EC1Y 1SP
United Kingdom

Sage Publications India Pvt. Ltd.
B-42, Panchsheel Enclave
Post Box 4109
New Delhi 110 017 India

Printed in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Creswell, John W.
Designing and conducting mixed methods research / John W. Creswell, Vicki L. Plano Clark.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-4129-2791-9 (cloth)

ISBN 1-4129-2792-7 (pbk.)

1. Social sciences—Research—Methodology. 2. Research—Evaluation.

I. Plano Clark, Vicki L. II. Title.

H62.C6962 2007

001.4'2—dc22

2006008436

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

06 07 08 09 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Acquisitions Editor: Lisa Cuevas Shaw
Editorial Assistant: Karen Greene
Production Editor: Denise Santoyo
Copy Editor: Catherine Chilton
Typesetter: C&M Digital (P) Ltd.
Indexer: Jeanne Busemeyer

Univerzita knihovna
Západočeské univerzity v Plzni

KN070002151

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|--------|
| List of Tables | xi |
| List of Figures | xiii |
| Preface | xv |
| Purpose of This Book | xv |
| Audience for the Book | xvi |
| Book Features | xvi |
| Acknowledgments | xvii |
| Chapter 1. Understanding Mixed Methods Research | 1 |
| Purpose and Organization | 2 |
| Clarifying Terms | 4 |
| What Is Mixed Methods Research? | 5 |
| The Name | 5 |
| Quantitative and Qualitative Data | 6 |
| Mixing the Data | 7 |
| Single or Multiple Studies | 8 |
| The Central Premise of the Definition | 8 |
| Studies That Fit Our Definition | 10 |
| Studies in the Gray Areas | 11 |
| The Importance of Mixed Methods Research | 13 |
| A Brief History | 13 |
| Formative Period | 13 |
| Paradigm Debate Period | 15 |
| Procedural Developments | 15 |
| Recent Indicators of Interest | 16 |
| SUMMARY | 18 |
| ACTIVITIES | 19 |
| ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE | 19 |
| Chapter 2. Examining Preliminary Considerations | 20 |
| Consider Worldview Stances | 21 |
| Different Worldviews or Paradigms | 21 |

| | | | |
|---|----|---|-----|
| Worldviews and Mixed Methods Research | 26 | The Embedded Design | 67 |
| <i>Stance 1: There is one "best" paradigm or worldview that fits mixed methods research</i> | 26 | <i>Embedded Design Procedures</i> | 67 |
| <i>Stance 2: Researchers can use multiple paradigms or worldviews in their mixed methods study</i> | 27 | <i>Variants of the Embedded Design</i> | 69 |
| <i>Stance 3: Worldviews relate to the type of mixed methods design and may vary depending on the type of design</i> | 27 | <i>Strengths of the Embedded Design</i> | 70 |
| The Basics of Quantitative and Qualitative Research | 28 | <i>Challenges in Using the Embedded Design</i> | 70 |
| Research Problems Addressed by Mixed Methods | 31 | The Explanatory Design | 71 |
| A Need Exists for Both Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches | 32 | <i>Explanatory Design Procedures</i> | 72 |
| A Need Exists to Enhance the Study With a Second Source of Data | 33 | <i>Variants of the Explanatory Design</i> | 72 |
| A Need Exists to Explain the Quantitative Results | 34 | <i>Strengths of the Explanatory Design</i> | 74 |
| A Need Exists to First Explore Qualitatively | 34 | <i>Challenges in Using the Explanatory Design</i> | 74 |
| SUMMARY | 35 | The Exploratory Design | 75 |
| ACTIVITIES | 35 | <i>Exploratory Design Procedures</i> | 77 |
| ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE | 36 | <i>Variants of the Exploratory Design</i> | 77 |
| Chapter 3. Locating and Reviewing Mixed Methods Studies | 38 | <i>Strengths of the Exploratory Design</i> | 78 |
| Searching for and Reviewing Mixed Methods Studies | 39 | <i>Challenges in Using the Exploratory Design</i> | 78 |
| Use Search Terms | 39 | Selecting a Type of Mixed Methods Design | 79 |
| Are the Studies Mixed Methods Research? | 39 | The Timing Decision | 81 |
| A Mixed Methods Notation System and Visual Diagrams | 40 | The Weighting Decision | 81 |
| Four Examples of Mixed Methods Studies | 41 | The Mixing Decision | 83 |
| Study A: Collecting Both Quantitative and Qualitative Data at the Same Time to Understand a Problem (Jenkins, 2001) | 44 | <i>Merging Data Sets</i> | 83 |
| Study B: Using Qualitative Data in an Experiment (Rogers, Day, Randall, & Bentall, 2003) | 45 | <i>Embedding Data at the Design Level</i> | 83 |
| Study C: Explaining Quantitative Results With Qualitative Data (Aldridge, Fraser, & Huang, 1999) | 48 | <i>Connecting From Data Analysis to Data Collection</i> | 83 |
| Study D: Exploring Qualitatively to Develop a Quantitative Instrument (Myers & Oetzel, 2003) | 50 | Implementing the Design Decisions | 84 |
| Similarities and Differences Among the Sample Studies | 54 | Writing a Paragraph to Identify a Study's Design | 86 |
| SUMMARY | 56 | SUMMARY | 86 |
| ACTIVITIES | 57 | ACTIVITIES | 87 |
| ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE | 57 | ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE | 88 |
| Chapter 4. Choosing a Mixed Methods Design | 58 | Chapter 5. Introducing a Mixed Methods Study | 89 |
| Classifications of Mixed Methods Designs | 59 | Writing a Mixed Methods Title | 90 |
| The Four Major Types of Mixed Methods Designs | 59 | Qualitative and Quantitative Titles | 90 |
| The Triangulation Design | 62 | Mixed Methods Titles | 91 |
| <i>Triangulation Design Procedures</i> | 62 | Stating the Problem in the Introduction | 94 |
| <i>Variants of the Triangulation Design</i> | 64 | Structure of a "Statement of the Problem" Section | 94 |
| <i>Strengths of the Triangulation Design</i> | 66 | Integrate Mixed Methods Into the Statement of the Problem | 95 |
| <i>Challenges in Using the Triangulation Design</i> | 66 | The Purpose Statement | 97 |
| | 66 | Qualitative and Quantitative Purpose Statements | 97 |
| | | Mixed Methods Purpose Statements | 98 |
| | | Research Questions and Hypotheses | 103 |
| | | Qualitative Questions and Quantitative Questions and Hypotheses | 103 |
| | | Mixed Methods Research Questions | 105 |
| | | SUMMARY | 107 |
| | | ACTIVITIES | 108 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Chapter 6. Collecting Data in Mixed Methods Research | 110 |
| Procedures in Qualitative and Quantitative Data Collection | 111 |
| Sampling Procedures | 112 |
| Permissions Needed | 113 |
| Information to Be Collected | 114 |
| Recording the Data | 115 |
| Administering the Data Collection | 116 |
| Data Collection in Mixed Methods Designs | 116 |
| Concurrent Data Collection Issues | 117 |
| <i>Participant Selection</i> | 119 |
| <i>The Sample Size Question</i> | 119 |
| <i>When Contradictory Results Occur</i> | 120 |
| <i>Introducing Potential Bias Through Data Collection</i> | 120 |
| Sequential Data Collection Issues | 121 |
| <i>Sampling the Same or Different Individuals</i> | 122 |
| <i>Using the Same or Different Sample Sizes</i> | 123 |
| <i>Selecting Results for the Follow-Up</i> | 123 |
| <i>Designing an Instrument</i> | 123 |
| SUMMARY | 125 |
| ACTIVITIES | 127 |
| ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE | 127 |
| Chapter 7. Analyzing Data in Mixed Methods Research | 128 |
| Procedures in Quantitative and Qualitative Data Analysis | 128 |
| Preparing the Data for Analysis | 130 |
| Exploring the Data | 130 |
| Analyzing the Data | 131 |
| Representing the Data Analysis | 132 |
| Validating the Data | 133 |
| Data Analysis Within Mixed Methods Designs | 135 |
| Concurrent Data Analysis | 136 |
| <i>Data Transformation</i> | 137 |
| <i>Comparisons Through a Matrix or Discussion</i> | 140 |
| Sequential Data Analysis | 142 |
| <i>When Quantitative Data Are Collected First</i> | 144 |
| <i>When Qualitative Data Are Collected First</i> | 145 |
| Validate the Data Within a Mixed Methods Design | 145 |
| SUMMARY | 148 |
| ACTIVITIES | 149 |
| ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE | 149 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Chapter 8. Writing and Evaluating Mixed Methods Research | 151 |
| General Guidelines for Writing | 152 |
| Organize the Structure of the Writing So That It Relates to the Designs | 153 |
| Structure of a Proposal for a Dissertation or Thesis | 154 |
| Structure of the Project Narrative for a National Institutes of Health Proposal | 157 |
| Structure of a Mixed Methods Journal Article | 159 |
| Evaluating a Mixed Methods Study Within Designs | 162 |
| Quantitative and Qualitative Standards | 163 |
| Mixed Methods Standards | 163 |
| SUMMARY | 165 |
| ACTIVITIES | 165 |
| ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE | 166 |
| Chapter 9. Questions Often Raised About Mixed Methods Research | 167 |
| Anticipate Mixed Methods Questions | 168 |
| What Is Mixed Methods Research? | 168 |
| It Is Not Just Qualitative Research | 168 |
| It Is Not Mixed Model Research | 169 |
| It Is Not a Method That Researchers Have Always Used | 169 |
| It Is an Approach That Can Be Learned | 170 |
| <i>Published Journal Articles</i> | 170 |
| <i>Methodological Literature</i> | 170 |
| <i>Syntheses of Mixed Methods Studies</i> | 172 |
| It Has a Philosophical or Worldview Foundation | 173 |
| Is Mixed Methods Research Accepted? | 174 |
| Several Factors Have Sparked Interest | 175 |
| If It Is Rigorous, Graduate Faculty Will Support It | 175 |
| Funding Agencies Support Mixed Methods Research | 176 |
| Journals Will Publish It | 177 |
| Acceptance Is Extending to Different Disciplines and Across Cultures | 178 |
| Is Mixed Methods Research Realistic? | 180 |
| Researchers Need Specific Skills | 180 |
| It Requires Time and Resources | 181 |
| SUMMARY | 182 |
| ACTIVITIES | 183 |
| ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE | 183 |
| Chapter 10. Future Directions for Mixed Methods Research | 184 |
| Needed Developments in Mixed Methods Research | 185 |
| Mixed Methods Designs and Associated Procedural Issues | 185 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Mixed Methods Designs and Different Worldviews | 189 |
| Applications of Mixed Methods Research | 190 |
| Implications and the Value of Using Mixed Methods | 191 |
| SUMMARY | 192 |
| ACTIVITIES | 193 |
| ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE | 193 |
| Appendix A. A Triangulation Design | 194 |
| Appendix B. An Embedded Design | 204 |
| Appendix C. An Explanatory Design | 216 |
| Appendix D. An Exploratory Design | 239 |
| References | 256 |
| Index | 266 |
| About the Authors | 274 |

LIST OF TABLES

| | |
|---|-----|
| Table 1.1. Selected Writers Important in the Development of Mixed Methods Research and Their Contributions | 14 |
| Table 2.1. Four Worldviews Used in Research | 22 |
| Table 2.2. Common Elements of Worldviews and Implications for Practice | 24 |
| Table 2.3. The Four Elements Basic to Any Research Process | 25 |
| Table 2.4. Elements of Qualitative and Quantitative Research in the Process of Research | 29 |
| Table 2.5. Types of Research Problems and Matching Methods or Designs | 32 |
| Table 3.1. Features of the Four Sample Mixed Methods Studies | 55 |
| Table 4.1. Mixed Methods Design Classifications | 60 |
| Table 4.2. The Major Mixed Methods Design Types | 85 |
| Table 5.1. Deficiencies in the Literature, Type of Design, and Reasons for Using the Design | 96 |
| Table 5.2. Types of Mixed Methods Designs, Variants, and Research Questions | 106 |
| Table 6.1. Phases in the Data Collection Process for Qualitative and Quantitative Research | 111 |
| Table 7.1. Procedures in Quantitative and Qualitative Data Analysis | 129 |
| Table 7.2. Example of Matrix Using Qualitative Theme Counts, Including Data Transformation | 139 |
| Table 7.3. Example of Matrix Using Quantitative Variables (Strengths) and Qualitative Themes, With Text Data Quotes | 141 |
| Table 7.4. Potential Threats to the Validity of Concurrent Designs in Mixed Methods Research | 147 |
| Table 7.5. Potential Threats to the Validity of Sequential Designs in Mixed Methods Research | 148 |
| Table 8.1. Outline of the Structure of a Proposal for a Dissertation or Thesis | 155 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Table 8.2. National Institutes of Health Guidelines for a Proposal Narrative for a Mixed Methods Study | 158 |
| Table 8.3. Outline of the Structure for a Mixed Methods Journal Article | 161 |
| Table 9.1. Literature Review Syntheses of the "Methods" in Mixed Methods Research Studies From Different Disciplines | 174 |
| Table 10.1. Topics for Future Research and Questions That Need to Be Answered | 186 |

LIST OF FIGURES

| | |
|---|-----|
| Figure 1.1. Framework Used in This Book for Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research | 3 |
| Figure 1.2. Three Ways of Mixing Quantitative and Qualitative Data | 7 |
| Figure 1.3. Examples of Single- and Multiple-Study Mixed Methods Research | 8 |
| Figure 2.1. The Birthday Cake | 36 |
| Figure 3.1. Ten Guidelines for Drawing Visual Diagrams for Mixed Methods Studies | 42 |
| Figure 3.2. Checklist for Reviewing the Features of a Mixed Methods Study | 44 |
| Figure 3.3. Visual Diagram of the Procedures in a Study in Which Both Quantitative and Qualitative Data Were Collected at the Same Time | 46 |
| Figure 3.4. Visual Diagram of the Procedures in a Study Using Qualitative Data Within an Experiment | 49 |
| Figure 3.5. Visual Diagram of the Procedures in a Study Using Qualitative Data to Explain Quantitative Results | 51 |
| Figure 3.6. Visual Diagram of the Procedures Used to Measure Exploratory Qualitative Results With Quantitative Data | 53 |
| Figure 4.1. The Triangulation Design | 63 |
| Figure 4.2. The Embedded Design | 68 |
| Figure 4.3. The Explanatory Design | 73 |
| Figure 4.4. The Exploratory Design | 76 |
| Figure 4.5. Decision Tree for Mixed Methods Design Criteria for Timing, Weighting, and Mixing | 80 |
| Figure 4.6. Sample Paragraph Introducing a Mixed Methods Design | 87 |
| Figure 6.1. Concurrent Forms of Mixed Methods Data Collection | 118 |
| Figure 6.2. Sequential Forms of Mixed Methods Data Collection | 122 |
| Figure 6.3. Procedures for an Exploratory Instrument Design Mixed Methods Study | 126 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Figure 7.1. Concurrent Data Analysis Procedures in Triangulation and Embedded Designs | 137 |
| Figure 7.2. Portion of Discussion Section Examining a Comparison of Quantitative and Qualitative Data Results | 142 |
| Figure 7.3. Sequential Data Analysis Procedures in Embedded Explanatory and Exploratory Designs | 143 |
| Figure 9.1. Examples of Mixed Methods Studies, by Design Type | 171 |
| Figure 9.2. Suggested Methodological Readings on Mixed Methods Research | 173 |
| Figure 9.3. Checklist for Evaluating the Level of Acceptance of Mixed Methods Research Within a Discipline | 179 |

PREFACE

PURPOSE OF THIS BOOK •

Researchers in the social, health, and human sciences have a wide range of research methods from which to choose. These methods range from the quantitative to the qualitative, and now researchers and graduate students across the social sciences have begun to combine these methods in mixed methods designs. Mixed methods research has been gaining in acceptance and becoming more common in studies across the social sciences, including diverse fields such as sociology, nursing, health, management, evaluation, and education.

From our collective research experiences and conversations with colleagues, we have found that a mixed methods approach has interdisciplinary appeal to many researchers. These researchers hold increasingly diverse worldviews and tackle complex issues and problems that beg for a blending of qualitative and quantitative data. Hence, mixed methods designs provide researchers, across research disciplines, with a rigorous approach to answering their research questions.

Much has been written about the use of mixed methods, but these writings are, typically, difficult to locate and are conceptual and theoretical in nature rather than applied. In addition, there is little available practical advice about how to actually design and conduct a mixed methods research study that is both of acceptable quality and feasible.

The purpose of this book is to provide an introduction to mixed methods research, to discuss the steps involved in designing and conducting this form of inquiry, and, within these steps, to focus on four types of mixed methods designs. We set out to write a book that builds from the literature and offers mixed methods researchers practical advice for conceptualizing, proposing, designing, conducting, and publishing their mixed methods studies. Our hope is that a better understanding of mixed methods research can result in better research across the social, health, and human sciences.

Furthermore, it may lead to the development of a new generation of researchers who have the skills and experiences to use wisely those research techniques and tools that are most appropriate for the complex questions being studied today, as well as those that will be studied in the future.

● AUDIENCE FOR THE BOOK

This book targets advanced graduate students as well as researchers at all levels from diverse disciplines who are designing mixed methods studies. We have attempted to combine the latest thinking about mixed methods research designs with practical, step-by-step guidelines and recommendations for the decisions that researchers must make when designing a mixed methods research study. We offer advice that will assist researchers in negotiating the demands and issues that arise as they design a mixed methods project, including suggestions on how to keep a project manageable for a beginning researcher and still ensure quality research. The book concludes with a discussion of current issues in mixed methods research and the common questions that confront mixed methods researchers who are planning a mixed methods study. We hear these questions asked time and time again when we work with researchers individually, at workshops, and in graduate courses.

● BOOK FEATURES

We have incorporated a number of features throughout the book to facilitate its use by researchers designing their own studies and by graduate students learning about mixed methods research in a course or seminar. We have organized the content using an overall guiding framework of the process of designing and conducting a mixed methods study. Although aspects of this process may simplify the reality of a complex and nonlinear process, they provide a guiding framework that can be very helpful to researchers new to mixed methods research. In addition, we discuss mixed methods research in terms of a parsimonious set of four major types of designs, and we highlight variants within each of the major designs. To help illustrate the practical side of conducting mixed methods research, we have included four complete mixed methods articles in the book, and we refer to additional examples drawn from across the social, behavioral, and health sciences.

The content of the book takes the reader through the process of designing and conducting a research study. Building on the ideas discussed within Creswell's (2003) *Research Design*, we introduce each topic by reviewing its

application within quantitative and qualitative research and then address it from the point of view of mixed methods research in general and from the perspective of each of the four mixed methods designs in particular. We emphasize the procedures and special challenges that researchers face in each of the designs and offer practical guidelines, checklists, and scripts to help researchers plan out and implement a rigorous mixed methods design. Each chapter concludes with a short list of important references that readers can turn to for a more theoretical treatment of the topics. To facilitate the adoption of this text for a graduate level course or its use in a seminar, a brief list of suggested activities to guide the reader through specific steps in developing and writing a proposal for a mixed methods study is also included at the end of each chapter.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ●

Our work and this book has benefited greatly from the contributions of many. We begin by thanking our acquisition editor at Sage Publications, Lisa Cuevas Shaw, for her encouragement, coordination, and support throughout the project. We also thank Allison Munditt, executive vice president at Sage Publications, for her continued support of our writing on research methods, and Catherine Chilton for her thoughtful and detailed editing. Several individuals deserve thanks because they took the time to carefully review the manuscript. Dr. Ronald J. Shope of our Office of Qualitative and Mixed Methods Research at the University of Nebraska–Lincoln provided a thoughtful review, with close attention to many aspects of the project, and three anonymous reviewers wrote helpful suggestions for early revisions of the manuscript.

We also thank Dr. Nataliya V. Ivankova of the University of Alabama–Birmingham and Dr. Michael Feters of the University of Michigan, who helped us shape many ideas discussed in this book through their methodological work and their involvement as workshop leaders. We are also grateful for the questions, insights, and feedback offered by those scholars, to whom we are indebted, who participated in our workshops across many disciplines and across many regions of the United States and abroad. We also thank the graduate students who have taken our mixed methods course, which has been offered at the University of Nebraska–Lincoln since 1998. Individuals in our Office of Qualitative and Mixed Methods Research at the University of Nebraska–Lincoln also helped shape our ideas through conducting mixed methods studies: Dr. Yun Lu, Dr. Shirley Trout, Jill Brown, Rob McEntarffer, and Mike Wirth. We are also indebted to the Department of Family Medicine at the University of Michigan and to the Veterans Affairs Ann